

Administration and Operations Committee Report

To: To the Chair and Members of the Administration and Operations Committee

From: Brandon Kortleve, Planner – Policy Planning

Date: November 21, 2023

Report #: RPT-0473-23

Subject: 3-7 Yeo Street – Heritage Evaluation and Recommendations

Purpose: For Approval

Recommendation

WHEREAS a delegation was received from Scott Patterson of Patterson Planning Consultants Inc., representing the owners of the properties at 3 and 7 Yeo Street in Paris,

AND WHEREAS the properties are located in a 'Heritage Area' overlay of the Official Plan, within the 'Built and Cultural Heritage' zoning under County of Brant Zoning By-Law 61-16, and identified on the County of Brant Heritage Inventory, necessitating evaluation for their cultural heritage interest or value prior to development,

AND WHEREAS the Brant Heritage Committee has completed the heritage evaluation in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and does not recommend that the properties be designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* at this time,

THEREFORE, THAT staff be directed to work with the property owners to integrate the comments of the Heritage Committee into the conditions for approval of the applicable development application(s) that may be required for the site.

AND THAT RPT-0473-23 be approved as a cultural heritage conservation strategy for the proposed redevelopment of 3 and 7 Yeo Street, with the applicable directions contained therein.

Executive Summary

The Brant Heritage Committee received a request from the owners of 3 and 7 Yeo Street in Paris to perform a heritage evaluation and provide comments to Council as required for the potential redevelopment of the site. This request was made in October 2023, and after a site visit and discussion with the Heritage Committee in November 2023, the committee has provided a preferred direction for Council's consideration. This direction forms the basis of this report, which is accompanied by a staff analysis of the information and is before Council for approval. The requested approval is only related to the heritage components of the proposed development, and future information on the development (such as parking, unit counts, height etc.) will form part of the full application made to the County of development of the site.

This report outlines directions and interventions to form a conservation strategy for the properties, outlining character-defining elements to be incorporated into the redevelopment, as well as specific considerations for the future zoning of the site with respect to its heritage character.

Strategic Plan Priority

Strategic Priority 1 - Sustainable and Managed Growth

Strategic Priority 3 - Economic Resilience

Impacts and Mitigation

Social Impacts

The development of these lands will result in alterations to the historic identity of an established neighbourhood. Public input will form an important aspect of the redevelopment plans for this site.

Environmental Impacts

Consideration of environmental impacts is required, including opportunities for waste diversion and salvage, and consultation will be done to ensure that any impacts on the heritage river system will provide only a net-benefit to the area. Also considered is the impact of development within the Special Policy Area flood plain, which must balance community investment with flood risk management to achieve protection of public health and safety through the development process.

Economic Impacts

Being located approximately a 12-minute walk (~600m) from Grand River Street North's main commercial area in Downtown Paris, this site provides an opportunity for investment in proximity to an area of major commercial, tourist, and economic success. The site has historically been located in an area of commerce in the Town of Paris, being home to several office and industrial uses, and provides an opportunity for a multi-use redevelopment that meets the objectives of creating complete communities in the County of Brant.

Report

Background

On October 5th, 2023, Scott Patterson of Patterson Planning Consultants Inc., on behalf of the owners of 3 and 7 Yeo Street in Paris, came as a delegation before the Brant Heritage Committee to share information about the redevelopment of properties. The redevelopment, called "Willow Grove", would result in the demolition of the existing structures on the site. Planning policies require that the property be evaluated for its potential cultural heritage value or interest and after preliminary discussions with staff, the owners of the property approached the Heritage Committee for their input before making any application for demolition or redevelopment of the property. These applications are forthcoming, and the Heritage Committee and staff have worked proactively with the property owner and their consultant to evaluate the heritage value/interest of the property. This approach has provided for adequate identification and future retention of heritage characteristics to guide the future design of the development, as further presented by the findings and recommendations of this report.

Planning Context

Section 2 of the *Planning Act* states that land use planning shall be done in a way that has regard to matters of provincial interest, which includes the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archeological, or scientific interest.

The Ontario Heritage Act provides the framework for municipalities to evaluate properties to determine if they have cultural heritage value or interest for the purposes of conservation. Criteria for this evaluation are provided under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and provide the basis for a municipality to determine how to appropriately conserve built heritage resources such as old buildings or monuments.

The *Provincial Policy Statement (2020)* describes this conservation as the identification, protection, management, and use of built heritage resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained. *A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (Consolidated 2020)* further speaks to conservation of cultural heritage resources to foster a sense of place and benefit communities by contributing to our understanding of the history of places, events, and people.

The County of Brant's Official Plan (2012) provides direction specific to the County's objectives for evaluating cultural heritage resources as part of complete communities in Brant. Where development is proposed, the Brant Heritage Committee is directed to advise Council of their position and comments with respect to potential cultural heritage resources. This direction is used to determine appropriate conservation methods prior to the submission of a development application. The County's new Official Plan (2023), while not yet approved by the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing, provides a similar direction.

Section 4.43 of the *County of Brant Comprehensive Zoning By-law (2016)* encourages the evaluation and retention of existing buildings with potential heritage value by offering zoning incentives to reuse the buildings (or reuse components thereof) and provides the opportunity to regulate height, bulk, location, spacing, and character to be compatible with key heritage attributes of an area.

The directions of these various policies and standards have guided the evaluation and analysis of the proposed redevelopment by the Heritage Committee and by Staff with respect to the cultural heritage value/interest of the properties. A subsequent evaluation and analysis are included below.

Evaluation and Analysis

A site visit took place on Wednesday, November 1st, 2023, where staff were accompanied by members of the Heritage Committee to tour the existing structures at 3 and 7 Yeo Street and document the properties. Staff undertook a historical analysis of the properties with the assistance of the Paris Museum and Archives (Attachment 1), which accompany the information collected at the site visit (Attachment 2), to inform the evaluation to determine the cultural heritage value/interest of the properties.

After the tour and an initial discussion, it was decided that the scope of the evaluation would be narrowed to focus on the c. 1882 structure at 3 Yeo Street, referred to as the "Maxwell Wing". The home at 7 Yeo, constructed between 1911-1912, was documented during the site visit and in the opinion of the Committee did not require further evaluation. The same was said about the warehouse structure at 3 Yeo, where it was noted that further evaluation would only be needed for the Maxwell Wing to make a recommendation to Council on next steps.

The results of the building and site evaluation as it pertains to the Maxwell Wing at 3 Yeo Street are included in Table 1 below.

Table 1

Building & Site Evaluation System County of Brant Heritage Committee

Using the Evaluation Criteria of O.Reg. 9/06 under the Ontario Heritage Act

Historic Building Name(s): The Maxwell Wing, The Offices of The Paris Foundry and Agricultural Works

Location: 3 Yeo Street

Evaluation Date: November 2, 2023

Evaluation Category			Evaluation Score (10 points possible for each subcategory, out of a total 100 points)	
Design & Physical Value	Architectural Merit		5.8	
value	Style		6	
	Age		7	
	Workmanship		5.7	
	Alterations		3.5	
Historical & Associative Value	Historical Persons / Groups		5.8	
	Historical Event(s)		5.5	
	Local Development		5.5	
Contextual Value	Site		7.2	
	Landmark		6	
Final Score			58/100	
Evaluation Results and Scoring:				
50+ Points		40-49 Points	Fewer than 40 Points	
Designation under the Ontario Heritage Act should be considered, and a conservation strategy should be undertaken.		Recognition of the site should be considered within the proposed redevelopment	Documentation of the structure only. No designation or recognition considered.	

To accompany the evaluation, the Heritage Committee provides the following summary of key cultural heritage information related to the property's significance:

 The building was built under the ownership of David Maxwell by builder Duncan McKay in 1882. The building was built as the offices for Maxwell's Business "The Paris Foundry and Agricultural Works", which was established in 1859, and employed between 30 and 40 people.

- The architectural style of the building is unique in this area of Paris, with influences from the Second Empire architectural style evident in the concave mansard roof and hooded arched dormers, eclectic Italianate-inspired ornaments common along 19th century main streets, such as the generous bracketed eaves and decorative stone lintels, and vernacular elements such as the buff coloured brick that was commonly available in this area and the unique rounded bullnose corner seen more commonly in commercial districts of larger urban centres.
- Mrs. Fanny McKay purchased the property in 1894, within the first decade in history that married women had the right to hold property in their own name, an example of shifting gender distribution of property in Victorian Ontario.
- Charles Walker purchased a portion of the lands in 1914. He established The Walker Press Ltd. in 1916 and is thought to have leased the offices from Fanny before finally purchasing the offices 1920.
- The property has a long commercial and industrial history, namely for printing and graphic purposes, that began around 1914, employing upwards of 70 workers around the 1980s and 90s, and maintaining printing services on-site until the building was sold in 2021.

Using the County's established heritage evaluation system and the information collected from the site visit and background research, a heritage evaluation score of 58/100 was determined for the building. With the score being above 50 points, the Heritage Committee discussed the designation of property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and determined an appropriate conservation strategy for the development.

Along with the evaluation completed by the committee, the discussion about the merits of a designation considered the state of the building, its past uses, the surrounding historical development, and the fact that the property has been designated for redevelopment purposes since at least the 1990s (by the former Town of Paris Official Plan). While the score of the evaluation was above 50 points, there are many other factors to be considered when contemplating a designation of the property. After careful consideration, the Heritage Committee is not recommending the designation of the building under the *Ontario Heritage Act* at this time.

The conclusion has been made that the current building does have contextual value with respect to the history of this area as a place of commerce in Paris and has design/physical value with respect to the unique components of the building as a landmark at the corner of Yeo Street and Willow Street in the Flats area. However, it is evident that the building is in very poor condition and understood that the site has been deemed worthy of redevelopment since before the amalgamation of the County of Brant.

The Heritage Committee stated that it would prefer to see the demolition of the Maxwell Wing deferred until the new development plans are finalized and approved. The purpose of this action would be to preserve the structure from any unnecessary removal in case the property changes ownership or the development proposal changes direction. Staff note that that there is no mechanism available to the County at this time to implement this approach and that once a demolition permit has been applied for, there is no opportunity for the municipality to prevent the demolition of this building for heritage purposes because it has not been previously listed or designated on the Municipal Heritage Register. It should also be noted that it is likely not a financially feasible option for the developer to maintain only a portion of the building and that financial investment in heritage conservation efforts for the property

would be better directed to integrating key character defining elements into the design of the future development.

With this approach in mind, staff recommend that Council approve the following directions and interventions as part of the conservation strategy for this property:

- The focus for conservation be scoped to the "Maxwell Wing", being the portion of the building at the corner of Yeo and Willow that was constructed c. 1882.
- The character-defining elements of the building are the bullnose corner, buff brick, decorative stone lintels, and concave mansard roof with dormers.
- Wherever feasible, salvaged elements of the building (such as the decorative stone lintels) be integrated into the design of the new corner portion of the building. Where salvage is not feasible, replicated/similar items (such as the buff brick and mansard roofline) be integrated into the design of the corner portion of the building.
- The design of the building includes a flexible commercial space to pay homage to the previous industrial and commercial uses of the area (which will also help the property better meet the directions of the new Official Plan).
- The design provides a flexible public space for interpretive installation(s) that will be used to tell the history of the property and area.
- The other portions of the development are designed to be physically and visually compatible with but clearly distinguishable from the corner portion.
- The future zoning standards for the property be reflective of the heritage character of the area and the existing built form as further described in this report.

Under Section 4.43 of the County's Comprehensive Zoning By-Law, when a building in the heritage overlay is proposed to be removed, the provisions and standards for redevelopment of the site may be imposed through site specific provisions to the underlying zone category. This can be done to determine appropriate character, scale, massing, volume, floor area and location of buildings to be compatible with the heritage character and value of the area. Based on the discussions of the Heritage Committee, the following are the recommendations of staff with respect to determining appropriate heritage-related zoning standards for the redevelopment of the property, which have been provided as comments on the preapplication consultation meeting for the development. A conceptual illustration has been created by staff and included as Attachment 3 to help show how these directions might be integrated into the developer's vision for the site. These directions include:

- A podium at street-level of one or two stories, with the building being set at the
 property lines directly abutting Yeo and Willow Streets or only as far back as to provide
 access from the sidewalk to a public level above the regulatory flood level.
- Additional stories are setback approximately two or more metres to mimic the existing built form of the industrial building.
- The highest points of the development are focused at the centre of the site and along Willow Street. The surrounding portions of the development be setback to transition appropriately to surrounding the lower-profile sites.
- A minimum floor area equivalent to the footprint of the Maxwell Wing be provided as flexible commercial space (approximately 5% of the lot area, located on the ground floor).

Summary and Recommendations

Based on the heritage evaluation, site visit, and committee discussion, this report has been prepared to summarize the recommended directions for Council with respect to the heritage

components of this proposed development. Staff are of the opinion that the approach proposed in this report will appropriately and successfully retain the cultural heritage value and interest of the property. The recommendations of this report will support the redevelopment of the site to foster a sense of place and benefit the community by contributing to the understanding of the industrial history of Paris.

Upon council approval, this report will form the basis of the conservation strategy and a broad direction provided to the developer with respect to meeting the objective of conserving the cultural heritage value of 3 and 7 Yeo Street as part of the new development. Discussions will continue as the owner pursues the required applications for redevelopment of the site and the direction will be refined to coordinate these directions with the other comments and directions received as part of the pre-application consultation circulation.

Attachments

- 1. Historical Research Paris Museum and Archives
- 2. Site Photos Taken November 2023
- 3. Recommended Conceptual Design and Massing
- 4. Conceptual Plans (Submitted November 2023)

Reviewed By

- 1. Jennifer Boyer, Manager of Policy Planning
- 2. Kayla Cicman, Arts Culture and Heritage Officer
- 3. Zach Gable, Director of Economic Development and Tourism
- 4. Pam Duesling General Manager of Development Services

Copied To

- 1. County of Brant Heritage Committee
- 2. Alison Newton, CAO
- 3. Melissa Connor General Manager of Strategic Initiatives
- 4. Adam Crozier, Director of Corporate Strategy
- 5. Mat Vaughan Director of Development Planning
- 6. Richard Weidhaas Chief Building Official

By-law and/or Agreement

By-law Required	No
Agreement(s) or other documents to be signed by Mayor and /or Clerk	No